Israel: Dayan Goldberg Shlita Supports Adi Organ Donor Cards

June 23, 2008

Jews who keep Torah and mitzvos may sign on to obtain an Adi organ donor card announced HaGaon HaRav Zalman Nechemia Goldberg Shlita, a member of the Yerushalayim High Beis Din and son-in-law of the former posek of the generation, HaRav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach zt"l. Rav Goldberg made his comments in an interview to the European rabbinical publication "HaNa'aseh V'Nishma".

The dayan made his remarks in response to the relatively new law passed in Knesset pertaining to organ donations. The law (HERE) was condemned by the chareidi community, and the Eida Chareidis even called on followers to sign a card opposing the organ donations.

In the comprehensive interview, Rav Goldberg addressed numerous issues, including the need to write a "sefer yuchasin" (genealogy) and the prohibition against leaving Eretz Yisroel. Dayan Goldberg comes out favoring the organ donation program, taking a view contradicting United Torah Judaism party officials and the Eida Chareidis.

Rav Goldberg has spent years involved in the issue of determining the moment of death, rendering him well-suited to release such a ruling. Rav Goldberg points out that his father-in-law Rav Shlomo Zalman was very strict on this matter, while others disagreed with his view, and each person is compelled to follow the derech of his rav.

Rav Goldberg adds the stipulation that one must be certain to sign the optional clause that the time of death is to be determined by a competent rav, one chosen by the family of the deceased, adding he advises that the name of this rav also be stipulated. (Ladaat.net).

(Yechiel Spira – YWN (israel)

13 Comments »

1. Thank you Rav Goldberg, this will save many lives.
   Comment by cityofgold — June 23, 2008 @ 8:09 am

2. So much for brain death.....
   Comment by PizzaPizza — June 23, 2008 @ 9:38 am

3. “HaGaon HaRav Zalman Nechemia Goldberg Shlita, a member of the Yerushalayim High Beis Din and son-in-law of the former posek of the generation, HaRav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach zt”l”
   you make it sound like he is a rav for the aida hacharedis.
   Comment by Tsisis — June 23, 2008 @ 11:07 am

4. “taking a view contradicting United Torah Judaism party officials and the Eida Chareidis”
   Interesting since one of its biggest advocates is MK R’ Avrohom Ravitz who himself was beneficiary of a kidney donation
   Comment by brit — June 23, 2008 @ 11:17 am

5. Being that unfortunately the medical field in Israel has not been known for being of the highest moral standard (even within recent years)
   I'm surprised that the Rav is not concerned about hospitals abusing the system. I'd be interesting in knowing what the Rav's response would be. Is there anywhere we can see a summary of his psak?
   Comment by Softwords — June 23, 2008 @ 11:23 am

6. #3 Tsisis- I detect a cynical tone in your words- maybe and hopefully I am wrong- However you have no idea who R' Zalman Nechemia is- I learned by him for 3 years- there is nowhere in Shas- Rishonim- Poskim that he is not 1000% boki in- in addition Yiroso kodemes Lechohmoso- he does have different views on many issues but he is a gaon olim-

7. This is what klal yisroel needs, respect for different opinions and daas torah. HURRAY!!

8. you make it sound like he is a rav for the aida hacharedis. Why would he want to be?

9. Kidneys can be given by live donors. The (or my at least) question is, what organs can be donated post-mortem?

10. Reb Zalman Nechemiah is one of those rare individuals who respects and is respected by many sectors of the klal. He gives shiurim in both the black and white yeshivos, and has given smicha to students from both worlds. Halevai all politics would be abandoned for ahavas yisroel and ahavas hatorah.

11. I think that most organs can still be used an hour after death. The disparity has to be made between life saving organs, that fall under the auspices of hatzalos nefashos, and non life saving organs such as eyes, that clearly are ossur to remove.

   I met with R' Zalman Nechemiah several times, and received smichah from him. He doesn't need anyone's haskamah. Halachah today is not decided by consensus, but by everyone's individual rabbi. Choose wisely.

12. This is far less significant than it is made out to be. Rav Goldberg was one of the leading participants in the original (1986) ruling of the Rabbanut permitting organ donation. Since that time, by his own admission, he has not been involved in the issue. More recently having been appraised of the medical facts, he is no longer so comfortable with that original ruling, hence the call to have one's Rav decide on the standard of death.

13. "son-in-law of the former posek of the generation, HaRav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach zt"l."

   Since when do YWN writers apoint who was/is the posek of the generation? Perhaps Rav Moshe was?

   Just mentioning Rav Goldberg's relation to Rav Shlomo Zalman ZTL should be more than enough of a "credential". Readers from the Olam Hayeshivos should not need fabricated titles to remember the chochma and tzidkus of Rav Shlomo Zalman, Z'chuso Yagen Aleinu.